

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
NEW YORK COUNTY

PRESENT: HON. ARTHUR F. ENGORON PART 37

Justice

-----X

INDEX NO. 655570/2024

MARGARET NEMETH,

11/21/2025,

Plaintiff,

MOTION DATE 10/13/2025

- v -

MOTION SEQ. NO. 007 008

NEW YORK-PRESBYTERIAN COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
IRVING MEDICAL CENTER, COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
HEALTH CARE, INC.,

DECISION + ORDER ON MOTION

Defendants.

-----X

The following e-filed documents, listed by NYSCEF document number (Motion 007) 61, 62, 63, 64, 65,
FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION
were read on this motion for SETTLEMENT

The following e-filed documents, listed by NYSCEF document number (Motion 008) 55, 56, 57, 58, 59,
60,
were read on this motion for ATTORNEYS FEES

Upon the foregoing documents, and after a hearing held virtually on December 5, 2025, the
instant motions are hereby granted, without opposition, and the Class Action Settlement
Agreement (NYSCEF Doc. No. 54) and request for attorney's fees are hereby granted, pursuant
to the annexed Final Approval Order.

12/5/2025
DATE

HON. ARTHUR F. ENGORON
ARTHUR E. ENGORON, J.S.C.

CHECK ONE:

Form with checkboxes for CASE DISPOSED, GRANTED, DENIED, NON-FINAL DISPOSITION, GRANTED IN PART, SUBMIT ORDER, FIDUCIARY APPOINTMENT, SETTLE ORDER, INCLUDES TRANSFER/REASSIGN, OTHER, REFERENCE.

APPLICATION:

CHECK IF APPROPRIATE:

SUPREME COURT STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF NEW YORK

MARGARET NEMETH, on behalf of herself
and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK-PRESBYTERIAN
COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY IRVING
MEDICAL CENTER and COLUMBIA
UNIVERSITY HEALTH CARE, INC.

Defendant.

Index No. 655570/2024

~~PROPOSED~~ FINAL APPROVAL
ORDER

WHEREAS, a putative class action is pending in this Court entitled *Margaret Nemeth, et al. v. New York-Presbyterian Columbia University Irving Medical Center, et al.*, Index No. 655570 (the “Action”);

WHEREAS, Plaintiffs MARGARET NEMETH and JUANITA HUGGINS, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated (“Plaintiffs”) and Defendants NEW YORK-PRESBYTERIAN COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY IRVING MEDICAL CENTER and COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY HEALTH CARE, INC. (collectively “Defendants”) have entered into a Settlement Agreement (the “Settlement Agreement”) that settles the Action and provides for a complete dismissal with prejudice of the claims asserted against Defendants in the Action on the terms and conditions set forth in the Settlement Agreement, subject to the approval of the Court;

WHEREAS, unless otherwise defined in this Judgment, the capitalized terms herein shall have the same meaning as they have in the Settlement Agreement;

WHEREAS, by Order dated July 28, 2025, (“Preliminary Approval Order”), this Court: (a) preliminarily approved the Settlement; (b) certified the Settlement Class solely for purposes of effectuating the Settlement; (c) ordered that notice of the proposed settlement be provided to potential Settlement Class Members; (d) provided Settlement Class Members with the opportunity either to exclude themselves from the Settlement Class or to object to the proposed Settlement; and (e) scheduled a hearing regarding final approval of the Settlement;

WHEREAS, due and adequate notice has been given to the Settlement Class;

WHEREAS, no Class Members submitted objections;

WHEREAS, no Class Members submitted valid requests to be excluded from the Settlement;

WHEREAS, the Court conducted a hearing on December 5, 2025, (the “Final Approval Hearing”) to consider, among other things, (a) the Objection(s) to the Settlement; (b) whether the terms and conditions of the Settlement were fair, reasonable and adequate to the Settlement Class, and should therefore be approved; (c) whether Class Counsel’s motion for Fee Award and Costs should be granted; (d) whether Settlement Class Representatives’ motion for Service Award Payment should be granted; and (e) whether a judgment should be entered dismissing the Action with prejudice as against Defendants; and

WHEREFORE, the Court having reviewed and considered the Settlement Agreement, all papers filed and proceedings had herein connection with the Settlement, all oral and written comments received regarding the Settlement, and the record in the Action, and good cause appearing therefor;

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:

1. **Jurisdiction:** This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of the Action, and all matters relating to the Settlement, as well as personal jurisdiction over all of the Parties and each of the Settlement Class Members.

2. **Incorporation of Settlement Documents:** This Judgment incorporates and makes a part hereof: (a) the Settlement Agreement filed with the Court on July 16, 2025; (b) the Notice documents filed with the Court on July 16, 2025; and (c) the Preliminary Approval Order, dated July 28, 2025.

3. **Class Certification for Settlement Purposes:** The Court hereby affirms its determinations in the Preliminary Approval Order certifying, for the purposes of the Settlement only, the Action as a class action pursuant to CPLR §§ 901(a), 903, 905 and 907 on behalf of the Settlement Class consisting of “All individuals in the United States whose Private Information was compromised in the Defendant Data Security Incident that occurred between September 11, 2023 and March 7, 2024.” The Settlement Class includes approximately 29,629 people. The Settlement Class specifically excludes (1) the judge(s) presiding over this Action, and members of their direct families; (2) the Defendant, its subsidiaries, parent companies, successors, predecessors, and any entity in which the Defendant or its parents have a controlling interest, and their current or former officers and directors; and (3) Settlement Class Members who submit a valid Request for Exclusion prior to the Opt-Out deadline.

4. **Certification Requirements:** The requirements of CPLR § 901(a) have been met for settlement purposes, in that: (a) the Settlement Class is so numerous that joinder of all members is impracticable; (b) there are questions of law or fact common to the Settlement Class which predominate over any questions affecting only individual members; (c) the claims of the Settlement Class Representatives are typical of the claims of the Settlement Class; (d) the Settlement Class Representatives and Class Counsel will fairly and adequately protect the interests

of the Settlement Class; and (e) a class action is superior to other available methods for the fair and efficient adjudication of the controversy.

5. **Notice:** The Court finds that the dissemination of the Notice: (a) was implemented in accordance with the Preliminary Approval Order; (b) constituted the best notice practicable under the circumstances; (c) constituted notice that was reasonably calculated, under the circumstances, to apprise Settlement Class Members of (i) the pendency of the Action, (ii) the effect of the proposed Settlement (including the releases to be provided thereunder), (iii) Class Counsel's motion for a Fee Award and Costs, (iv) Settlement Class Representatives' motion for a Service Award Payment, (v) their right to object to any aspect of the Settlement, Class Counsel's motion for a Fee Award and Costs, and/or Settlement Class Representatives' motion for a Service Award Payment, (vi) their right to exclude themselves from the Settlement Class, and (vii) their right to appear at the Final Approval Hearing; (d) constituted due, adequate and sufficient notice to all persons and entities entitled to receive notice of the proposed Settlement; and (e) satisfied the requirements of CPLR §§ 904 and 908, the United States Constitution (including the Due Process Clause), and all other applicable law and rules.

6. **Objection:** There were no objections to the Settlement.

7. **Final Settlement Approval and Dismissal of Claims:** Pursuant to, and in accordance with, Article 9 of the Civil Practice Law and Rules, this Court hereby fully and finally approves the Settlement set forth in the Settlement Agreement in all respects (including, without limitation: the amount of the Settlement Fund; the Releases provided for in the Settlement Agreement; and the dismissal with prejudice of the claims asserted against Defendants in the Action), and finds that the Settlement is, in all respects, fair, reasonable and adequate to the

Settlement Class. The Parties are directed to implement, perform and consummate the Settlement in accordance with the terms and provisions contained in the Settlement Agreement.

8. Dismissal: Upon the Effective Date, the Action shall be, and hereby is dismissed with prejudice in its entirety as to the Defendants, with each party to bear their own costs and attorneys' fees, except as provided in the Settlement Agreement, and all of the claims of the Settlement Class Members shall be, and hereby are, dismissed and released pursuant to the Settlement Agreement.

9. Binding Effect: The terms of the Settlement Agreement and this Judgment shall be forever binding on Defendants, Plaintiffs and all other Settlement Class Members (regardless of whether or not any individual Settlement Class Member submitted a Claim Form or seeks or obtains a distribution or benefits under the terms of the Settlement), as well as their respective successors and assigns.

10. Releases: The releases set forth in the Settlement Agreement are expressly incorporated herein in all respects. The releases are effective as of the Effective Date. Accordingly, this Court orders that, upon the Effective Date, and in consideration of the Settlement benefits described in the Settlement Agreement, each Releasing Party shall be deemed to have released, acquitted, and forever discharged Defendants and each of the Released Parties from any and all Released Claims.

11. Enforcement: nothing in this Judgment shall bar any action by any of the Parties to enforce or effectuate the terms of the Settlement Agreement or this Judgment.

12. No Admissions: This Judgment and Order, and the Settlement Agreement, and all papers related thereto, are not, and shall not be construed to be, an admission by the Defendants of any liability, claim or wrongdoing in this Action or in any other proceeding.

13. **Release Bar:** Upon entry of this Order, Settlement Class members are hereby permanently barred and enjoined from instituting, commencing, or prosecuting, either directly or indirectly, any action or proceeding asserting any of the Released Claims against any of the Released Persons in this or any other forum.

14. **Retention of Jurisdiction:** Without affecting the finality of this Judgment in any way, this Court finds continuing and exclusive jurisdiction over: (a) the Parties for purposes of the administration, interpretation, implementation and enforcement of the Settlement; and (b) the Settlement Class Members for all matters relating to the Action.

15. **Attorneys' Fees:** Class Counsel's motion for a Fee Award and Costs is hereby GRANTED and Class Counsel is hereby awarded a Fee Award in the amount of Two Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$200,000) and Costs in the amount of Thirteen Thousand Nine Hundred Eighty Nine and Forty Three Cents (\$13,989.43) for their services in this action, which award the Court finds to be fair and reasonable pursuant to CPLR § 909, to be paid as set forth in the Settlement Agreement.

16. **Service Awards:** Settlement Class Representatives' motion for a Service Award Payment is hereby GRANTED and Settlement Class Representatives are awarded a Service Award Payment in the amount of Two Thousand Five Hundred Dollars and Zero Cents (\$2,500.00), to be paid as set forth in the Settlement Agreement.

17. **Modification of the Agreement of Settlement:** Without further approval from the Court, Plaintiff and Defendants are hereby authorized to agree to and adopt such amendments or modifications of the Settlement Agreement or any exhibits attached thereto to effectuate the Settlement that: (a) are not materially inconsistent with this Judgment; and (b) do not materially limit the rights of Settlement Class Members in connection with the Settlement. Without further

order of the Court, Plaintiffs and Defendants may agree to reasonable extensions of time to carry out any provisions of the Settlement.

18. Termination of Settlement: If the Settlement is terminated as provided in the Settlement Agreement or the Effective Date of the Settlement otherwise fails to occur, this Judgment shall be vacated, rendered null and void and be of no further force and effect, except as otherwise provided by the Settlement Agreement, and this Judgment shall be without prejudice to the rights of Plaintiff, the other Settlement Class Members and Defendants, and the Parties shall revert to their respective positions in the Action as of the date and time immediately preceding the execution of the Settlement Agreement.

19. Entry of Judgment: There is no just reason for delay of entry of this Judgment as a final judgment in this Action. Accordingly, the Clerk of the Court is expressly directed to immediately enter this final Judgment in the Action.

IT IS SO ORDERED this 5 day of DECEMBER, 2025.

HON. ARTHUR F. ENGORON

Hon. Arthur F. Engoron